

Transport and Works (Applications and Objections Procedure) (England and Wales) Rules
2006

Chiltern Railways TWA Application 2010 to the Secretary of State

Questions of Clarification

Evidence from Leo Eyles

The base year for demand flow forecasts and economic forecasts, is 2007 which was the peak of the longest unsustainable boom that we have ever seen. Since then we have experienced the worst recession since World War II and consensus economic forecasts are for either no or slow growth for at least the next five years and that would be typical of a an effectively deflated asset bubble like ours.

1. What are the actual detailed economic forecasts behind these objections?
2. What are the data and justification behind them?

Oxford as an area has a higher proportion of public sector employees than almost any other area in the Southeast. Forecasts by SEEDA are for a net fall of 100,000 public sector jobs in the next five years. There will be inevitable knock on job losses in other related sectors in the area.

3. Have such assumptions been included in the passenger forecasts and justifications?
4. What assumptions have you made for changed passenger forecasts and traffic flows for the increase in internet based home working?
5. In your conclusions you claim a positive net present value from the project of £289m which is questionable on a number of grounds. In order to reach that number what cost have you attributed to the reduced quality of life, health, happiness and productivity of the people living next to and close to the line?

Evidence from Neil Gibson and Patrick O'Sullivan

6. Why are no costs cited in the evidence presented by Mr Gibson or Mr O'Sullivan? Claims that there is a "robust and strong economic business case" cannot be considered credible when no costs are cited.

Approval of the Outline Business Case does not confer approval to proceed. A Full Business Case is the next stage in Government planning, and it cannot be assumed that this will be approved in the new economic situation.

EWB

7. What assumptions are made about the part that the Internet will play in developing the "knowledge arc"?

8. Have the costs and benefits been compared with the benefits of broadband Webex services?
9. What evidence is there that knowledge workers want to travel more by train or car?
10. What is the evidence that "a journey by car from Oxford to Milton Keynes can take between 70 to 90 minutes?"
11. What is the mean travel time?
12. What evidence is there that "the western section of EWR could contribute benefits to business from agglomeration and output improvements"?

Evidence from Graham Cross

13. (Paragraph 5.4) Chiltern Railways has entered into an agreement with Network Rail, in January this year, which guarantees the financing of the project. Is this Network Rail funding underwritten and if not, why not?
14. Furthermore you claim this will not increase public levels of debt which is incorrect under OECD measures. How would you justify your statement?
15. (Paragraph 6.2) you lay out the commercial business case for Evergreen 3. Can you give us more detail and justification for all of the positive and negative cash flows as well as supporting documentation?
16. Is this either a downside or base case projection and can you explain why the board gave approval for a project with such slim returns?

Evidence from Andy Coates

17. (Paragraph 1.3) Why is the term ecology used in the title, and the description of the remit in 1.3, when no mention of humans are made in this report?

Oxford English Dictionary definition of ecology: "branch of biology dealing with the relation of organisms to one another *and to the study of the interaction of people with their environment.*"

18. (Paragraph 1.6) Why is no mention of diesel exhaust or chemical pollutants other than nitrogen made in this report?
19. (Paragraph 1.8) Why were no studies of comparable intensity carried out in gardens in which children play daily, particularly since some of these gardens are below the level of the railway line?
20. (Paragraph 2.8) Why has it been assumed that there is such an entity as a "critical level" when the first chair of the Royal Commission on Environmental Pollution made it clear that all such thresholds are arbitrary?

Traffic

21. Why is there no statistic or detail on the impact on urban north Oxford? Please provide more detail, pollution, traffic forecasts, etc for the area and its major and minor roads.